Letter to the Editor

# Analyzing "Homotopy Perturbation Method for Solving Fourth-Order Boundary Value Problem" 

Afgan Aslanov

Department of Mathematics and Computing, Beykent University, Istanbul, Turkey
Correspondence should be addressed to Afgan Aslanov, afganaslanov@yahoo.com
Received 29 March 2011; Accepted 8 April 2011
Copyright © 2011 Afgan Aslanov. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

We analyze a previous paper by S. T. Mohyud-Din and M. A. Noor (2007) and show the mistakes in it. Then, we demonstrate a more efficient method for solving fourth-order boundary value problems.

## 1. Problem

Let us consider the fifth-order boundary problem of the type

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{(4)}(x)=f\left(u, u^{\prime}, u^{\prime \prime}, u^{\prime \prime \prime}\right)+g(x) \tag{1.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

with the boundary conditions

$$
\begin{equation*}
u(0)=\alpha_{1}, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=\alpha_{2}, \quad u(1)=\beta_{1}, \quad u^{\prime}(1)=\beta_{2}, \tag{1.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $f$ and $g$ are continuous functions and $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta_{1}$, and $\beta_{2}$ are real constants.
The homotopy perturbation method (HPM) is employed in [1] for solving such problems. The purpose of this paper is to point out the mistakes in paper [1] and demonstrate more efficient method for solving the problems of type (1.1)-(1.2).

First of all, we show the mistakes.
(1) In Example 3.2 the approximate solution

$$
\begin{equation*}
u_{\text {approx }}(x)=512+480 x+224.00000000226055 x^{2}+\ldots \tag{1.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

of the problem

$$
\begin{gather*}
u^{(4)}(x)=u(x)+u^{\prime \prime}(x)+e^{x}(x-3) \\
u(0)=1, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u(1)=0, \quad u^{\prime}(1)=-e \tag{1.4}
\end{gather*}
$$

(see formula (3.19) in [1]) has no relationship with the exact solution $u_{\text {exact }}(x)=(1-x) e^{x}$. And "error" is at least $u_{\text {approx }}(0)-u_{\text {exact }}(0)=512-e=509.28$.

It is strange that the authors demonstrated the reliability of the errors in the table (see Table 3.2 in [1]).
(2) In Example 3.3 the approximate solution

$$
\begin{equation*}
u_{\text {approx }}(x)=11.3472-262.827 x-3.40768 x^{3}+\ldots \tag{1.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

of the problem

$$
\begin{align*}
& u^{(4)}=\sin x+\sin ^{2} x-\left(u^{\prime \prime}(x)\right)^{2}  \tag{1.6}\\
& u(0)=0, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=1, \quad u(1)=\sin 1, \quad u^{\prime}(1)=\cos 1
\end{align*}
$$

(see formula (3.28) in [1]) has no relationship with the exact solution $u=\sin x$, since $u_{\text {approx }}(0)=11.3472, u_{\text {approx }}^{\prime}(0)=-262.827$.

## 2. Homotopy Perturbation Method

The basic ideas of the standard HPM were given by He [2,3], and a new interpretation of HPM was given by He [4]. We introduce a new reliable procedure for choosing the initial approximation in HPM. To do so, we consider the following general nonlinear differential equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
L u+N u=f(u, x) \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

with some initial boundary conditions, where $L$ and $N$ are, respectively, the linear and nonlinear operators.

According to HPM, we construct a homotopy which satisfies the following relations:

$$
\begin{equation*}
H(u, p)=L u-L v_{0}+p L v_{0}+p[N u-f(u, x)]=0 \tag{2.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $p \in[0,1]$ is an embedding parameter and $v_{0}$ is an initial approximation. When we put $p=0$ and $p=1$ in (2.2), we obtain

$$
\begin{equation*}
H(u, 0)=L u-L v_{0}, \quad H(u, 1)=L u+N u-f(u, x) \tag{2.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

respectively. In topology, this is called deformation and $L u-L v_{0}$ and $L u+N u-f(u, x)$ are called homotopics.

The solution of (2.2) is expressed as

$$
\begin{equation*}
u(x)=u_{0}(x)+p u_{1}(x)+p^{2} u_{2}(x)+\ldots . \tag{2.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Hence, the approximate solution of (1.5) can be expressed as

$$
\begin{equation*}
u(x, t)=u_{0}(x)+u_{1}(x)+u_{2}(x)+\ldots \tag{2.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

Mohyud-Din and Noor [1] tried to rewrite the problem as a system of integral equations and then HPM applied for each equation. In the use of HPM, what we are mainly concerned about are the auxiliary operator $L$ and the initial guess $v_{0}$. We take $L=\left(d / d x^{4}\right)(\cdot)$, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{0}=\alpha_{1}+\alpha_{2} x+A x^{3}+B x^{4}+L^{-1}(g(x)), \tag{2.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $A$ and $B$ are yet to be determined. Then using the boundary conditions $u(1)=\beta_{1}$, $u^{\prime}(1)=\beta_{2}$ we determine $A$ and $B$.

## 3. Applications

Here we apply the HPM to solve correctly the problems in [1].
Example 3.1 (see [1, Example 3.2]). We have

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{(4)}(x)=u(x)+u^{\prime \prime}(x)+e^{x}(x-3) \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

with boundary conditions

$$
\begin{equation*}
u(0)=1, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u(1)=0, \quad u^{\prime}(1)=-e . \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

We construct a homotopy which satisfies the relation

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{(4)}(x)-v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+p\left[v_{0}^{(4)}(x)-u(x)-u^{\prime \prime}(x)-e^{x}(x-3)\right]=0, \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{0}=1+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+L^{-1}\left(e^{x}(x-3)\right) . \tag{3.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Now substituting (3.4) into (3.3), we obtain

$$
\begin{align*}
u_{0}^{(4)} & +p u_{1}^{(4)}+p^{2} u_{2}^{(4)}+\cdots-v_{0}^{(4)}(x) \\
& +p\left[v_{0}^{(4)}(x)-u_{0}-p u_{1}-p^{2} u_{2}-\cdots-u_{0}^{\prime \prime}-p u_{1}^{\prime \prime}-p^{2} u_{2}^{\prime \prime}-\cdots-e^{x}(x-3)\right]=0 \tag{3.5}
\end{align*}
$$

and, equating the coefficients of a like powers of $p$, we get a system of equations:

$$
\begin{gather*}
u_{0}^{(4)}(x)-v_{0}^{(4)}(x)=0, \quad u_{0}(0)=1, \quad u_{0}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{0}^{\prime \prime}(0)=A, \quad u_{0}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=B, \\
u_{1}^{(4)}+v_{0}^{(4)}(x)-u_{0}-u_{0}^{\prime \prime}-e^{x}(x-3)=0, \quad u_{1}(0)=0, \\
u_{1}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{1}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{1}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0,  \tag{3.6}\\
u_{2}^{(4)}-u_{1}-u_{1}^{\prime \prime}=0, \quad u_{2}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0,
\end{gather*}
$$

$$
u_{3}^{(4)}-u_{2}-u_{2}^{\prime \prime}=0, \quad u_{3}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0, \ldots
$$

Solving (3.6), we get

Using only three-term approximation, we have

$$
\begin{aligned}
u= & u_{0}+u_{1}+u_{2}=6 x-7 e^{x}+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+x e^{x}+\frac{5}{2} x^{2}+\frac{2}{3} x^{3}+8 \\
& +20+x^{5}\left(\frac{1}{20} B+\frac{1}{10}\right)+x^{4}\left(\frac{1}{12} A+\frac{13}{24}\right)+x^{6}\left(\frac{1}{360} A+\frac{1}{144}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
& u_{0}=1+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+L^{-1}\left(e^{x}(x-3)\right) \\
& =1+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+6 x-7 e^{x}+x e^{x}+\frac{5}{2} x^{2}+\frac{2}{3} x^{3}+7 \\
& =6 x-7 e^{x}+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+x e^{x}+\frac{5}{2} x^{2}+\frac{2}{3} x^{3}+8, \\
& u_{1}=20+x^{5}\left(\frac{1}{20} B+\frac{1}{10}\right)+x^{4}\left(\frac{1}{12} A+\frac{13}{24}\right)+x^{6}\left(\frac{1}{360} A+\frac{1}{144}\right) \\
& +x^{7}\left(\frac{1}{840} B+\frac{1}{1260}\right)+\frac{1}{6} 14 x^{3}+\frac{1}{2} 16 x^{2}+e^{x}(2 x-20)+18 x, \\
& u_{2}=L^{-1}\left(u_{1}+u_{1}^{\prime \prime}\right) \\
& =L^{-1}\left(32 x-36 e^{x}+A x^{2}+\frac{A}{6} x^{4}+B x^{3}+\frac{A}{360} x^{6}+\frac{B}{10} x^{5}+\frac{B}{840} x^{7}\right. \\
& \left.+4 x e^{x}+\frac{29}{2} x^{2}+\frac{13}{3} x^{3}+\frac{3}{4} x^{4}+\frac{2}{15} x^{5}+\frac{1}{144} x^{6}+\frac{1}{1260} x^{7}+36\right) \\
& =52+x^{6}\left(\frac{1}{360} A+\frac{29}{720}\right)+x^{7}\left(\frac{1}{840} B+\frac{13}{2520}\right)+x^{8}\left(\frac{1}{10080} A+\frac{1}{2240}\right) \\
& +x^{9}\left(\frac{B}{30240}+\frac{1}{22680}\right)+x^{10}\left(\frac{A}{1814400}+\frac{1}{725760}\right)+x^{11}\left(\frac{B}{6652800}+\frac{1}{9979200}\right) \\
& +\frac{1}{6} 40 x^{3}+\frac{1}{2} 44 x^{2}+e^{x}(4 x-52)+48 x+\frac{3}{2} x^{4}+\frac{4}{15} x^{5}, \ldots \tag{3.7}
\end{align*}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
& +x^{7}\left(\frac{1}{840} B+\frac{1}{1260}\right)+\frac{1}{6} 14 x^{3}+\frac{1}{2} 16 x^{2}+e^{x}(2 x-20)+18 x \\
& +52+x^{6}\left(\frac{A}{360}+\frac{29}{720}\right)+x^{7}\left(\frac{B}{840}+\frac{13}{2520}\right)+x^{8}\left(\frac{A}{10080}+\frac{1}{2240}\right) \\
& +x^{9}\left(\frac{B}{30240}+\frac{1}{22680}\right)+x^{10}\left(\frac{A}{1814400}+\frac{1}{725760}\right)+x^{11}\left(\frac{B}{6652800}+\frac{1}{9979200}\right) \\
& +\frac{1}{6} 40 x^{3}+\frac{1}{2} 44 x^{2}+e^{x}(4 x-52)+48 x+\frac{3}{2} x^{4}+\frac{4}{15} x^{5} . \tag{3.8}
\end{align*}
$$

Now it follows from conditions $u(1)=0, u^{\prime}(1)=-e$ that $A=-0.46717$ and $B=-0.38354$ and, therefore,

$$
\begin{align*}
u= & u_{0}+u_{1}+u_{2}=80+72 x-79 e^{x}+7 x e^{x}+32.033 x^{2}+9.2832 x^{3}+2.0027 x^{4} \\
& +0.34749 x^{5}+4.4627 \times 10^{-2} x^{6}+5.0392 \times 10^{-3} x^{7}+4.0008 \times 10^{-4} x^{8}  \tag{3.9}\\
& +3.1409 \times 10^{-5} x^{9}+1.1204 \times 10^{-6} x^{10}+4.2558 \times 10^{-8} x^{11},
\end{align*}
$$

or, in power series form,

$$
\begin{align*}
u= & 1-0.467 x^{2}-0.38347 x^{3}-0.1223 x^{4}-0.01918 x^{5}-6.762 \times 10^{-3} x^{6}  \tag{3.10}\\
& -9.132 \times 10^{-4} x^{7}+4.0008 \times 10^{-4} x^{8}+3.1409 \times 10^{-5} x^{9} .
\end{align*}
$$

Higher accuracy level can be attained by evaluating some more terms of $u(x)$.
Example 3.2 (see [1, Example 3.3]). We have

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{(4)}(x)=\sin x+\sin ^{2} x-\left(u^{\prime \prime}(x)\right)^{2} \tag{3.11}
\end{equation*}
$$

with boundary conditions

$$
\begin{equation*}
u(0)=0, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=1, \quad u(1)=\sin 1, \quad u^{\prime}(1)=\cos 1 \tag{3.12}
\end{equation*}
$$

(the exact solution of the problem is $u=\sin x$ ).
We construct a homotopy which satisfies the relation

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{(4)}(x)-v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+p\left[v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+\left(u^{\prime \prime}(x)\right)^{2}-\sin x-\sin ^{2} x\right]=0, \tag{3.13}
\end{equation*}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
v_{0}=x+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+L^{-1}\left(\sin x+\sin ^{2} x\right) \tag{3.14}
\end{equation*}
$$

Substituting (3.14) into (3.13), we obtain

$$
\begin{equation*}
u_{0}^{(4)}+p u_{1}^{(4)}+p^{2} u_{2}^{(4)}+\cdots-v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+p\left[v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+\left(u_{0}^{\prime \prime}+p u_{1}^{\prime \prime}+p^{2} u_{2}^{\prime \prime}+\cdots\right)^{2}-\sin x-\sin ^{2} x\right]=0 \tag{3.15}
\end{equation*}
$$

and, equating the coefficients of a like powers of $p$, we get a system of equations:

$$
\begin{gather*}
u_{0}^{(4)}(x)-v_{0}^{(4)}(x)=0, \quad u_{0}(0)=1, \quad u_{0}(0)=0, \\
u_{0}^{\prime}(0)=1, \quad u_{0}^{\prime \prime}(0)=A, \quad u_{0}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=B, \\
u_{1}^{(4)}+v_{0}^{(4)}(x)+\left(u_{0}^{\prime \prime}\right)^{2}-\sin x-\sin ^{2} x=0, \quad u_{1}(0)=0, \\
u_{1}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{1}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{1}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0, \\
u_{2}^{(4)}+2 u_{0}^{\prime \prime} u_{1}^{\prime \prime}=0, \quad u_{2}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{2}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0, \\
u_{3}^{(4)}+\left(u_{1}^{\prime \prime}\right)^{2}+2 u_{0}^{\prime \prime} u_{2}^{\prime \prime}=0, \quad u_{3}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime \prime}(0)=0, \quad u_{3}^{\prime \prime \prime}(0)=0, \ldots \tag{3.16}
\end{gather*}
$$

Solving (3.16) we get

$$
\begin{align*}
u_{0}= & x+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+L^{-1}\left(\sin x+\sin ^{2} x\right) \\
= & x+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+\frac{1}{32}+\sin x-\frac{1}{32} \cos 2 x+\frac{1}{6} x^{3}-\frac{1}{16} x^{2}-x+\frac{1}{48} x^{4}, \\
u_{1}= & -\frac{1}{1260} A x^{7}-x^{8}\left(\frac{1}{5040} A+\frac{1}{1680} B\right)-x^{9}\left(\frac{1}{6048} B-\frac{1}{90720} A\right) \\
& +x^{10}\left(\frac{A}{113400}+\frac{B}{100800}-\frac{1}{181440}\right)-\frac{1}{6} A^{2} x^{4}-\frac{1}{40} B^{2} x^{6}-\frac{1}{10} A B x^{5}+O\left(x^{11}\right), \\
u_{2}= & x^{14}\left(\frac{1}{7567560} A^{2}+\frac{1}{30270240} A B+\frac{1}{23284800} A-\frac{1}{1441440} B^{2}+\frac{1}{2522520} B\right) \\
& +x^{13}\left(\frac{1}{21621600} A^{2}-\frac{17}{5405400} A B+\frac{1}{1853280} A-\frac{1}{739200} B^{2}+\frac{43}{43243200} B\right) \\
& +x^{11}\left(-\frac{23}{4989600} A^{2}+\frac{1}{15400} A B+\frac{13}{158400} B^{2}\right)+x^{10}\left(\frac{17}{226800} A^{2}+\frac{1}{4200} B A\right) \\
& +x^{12}\left(-\frac{1}{249480} A^{2}-\frac{13}{3326400} A B+\frac{1}{907200} A+\frac{1}{44352} B^{2}\right) \\
& +x^{9}\left(\frac{1}{3780} A^{2}+\frac{1}{336} B^{3}\right)+\frac{1}{45} A^{3} x^{6}+\frac{4}{105} A^{2} B x^{7}+\frac{9}{560} A B^{2} x^{8} . \tag{3.17}
\end{align*}
$$

Using only three-term approximation we have

$$
\begin{align*}
u= & x+A x^{2}+B x^{3}+\frac{1}{32}+\sin x-\frac{1}{32} \cos 2 x+\frac{1}{6} x^{3}-\frac{1}{16} x^{2}-x+\frac{1}{48} x^{4} \\
& -\frac{1}{1260} A x^{7}-x^{8}\left(\frac{1}{5040} A+\frac{1}{1680} B\right)-x^{9}\left(\frac{1}{6048} B-\frac{1}{90720} A\right)  \tag{3.18}\\
& +x^{10}\left(\frac{1}{113400} A+\frac{1}{100800} B-\frac{1}{181440}\right)-\frac{1}{6} A^{2} x^{4}-\frac{1}{40} B^{2} x^{6}-\frac{1}{10} A B x^{5} \\
& +x^{9}\left(\frac{1}{3780} A^{2}+\frac{1}{336} B^{3}\right)+\frac{1}{45} A^{3} x^{6}+\frac{4}{105} A^{2} B x^{7}+\frac{9}{560} A B^{2} x^{8} .
\end{align*}
$$

Now by using the conditions $u(1)=\sin 1, u^{\prime}(1)=\cos 1$, we have a system of equations of degree three. Solving this system numerically (applying some standard computer programs) we have that $A=5.8611 \times 10^{-3}, B=-0.17455$ and the series solution

$$
\begin{align*}
u & =x+5.861 \times 10^{-3} x^{2}-0.17455 x^{3}-6.3333 \times 10^{-6} x^{4}+8.4356 \times 10^{-3} x^{5} \\
& +2.0161 \times 10^{-3} x^{6}-2.0329 \times 10^{-4} x^{7}-9.2803 \times 10^{-5} x^{8}+O\left(x^{9}\right) \tag{3.19}
\end{align*}
$$

## 4. Conclusion

In this paper we have used the homotopy perturbation method for finding the solution of fourth-order linear and nonlinear boundary value problems. We presented a simple way to choose $L$ and $v_{0}$ when we use the homotopy perturbation method. In most cases, our simple choice yields very good approximation of exact solution.

## References

[1] S. T. Mohyud-Din and M. A. Noor, "Homotopy perturbation method for solving fourth-order boundary value problems," Mathematical Problems in Engineering, vol. 2007, Article ID 98602, 15 pages, 2007.
[2] J. H. He, "A coupling method of a homotopy technique and a perturbation technique for non-linear problems," International Journal of Non-Linear Mechanics, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 37-43, 2000.
[3] J. H. He, "Some asymptotic methods for strongly nonlinear equations," International Journal of Modern Physics B, vol. 20, no. 10, pp. 1141-1199, 2006.
[4] J. H. He, "New interpretation of homotopy perturbation method," International Journal of Modern Physics B, vol. 20, no. 18, pp. 2561-2568, 2006.


